ARTS & CULTURE ORGANIZATIONS

A Study of their Occupations



January 2004

With support from **THE CLEVELAND FOUNDATION** and **GEORGE GUND FOUNDATION** and additional support from

THE KULAS FOUNDATION and JOHN P. MURPHY FOUNDATION

INTRODUCTION

The Community Partnership for Arts and Culture (The Partnership) requested that The Greater Cleveland Growth Association (Growth) provide research support in determining the types of occupations employed by arts & culture organizations in the Cleveland region, particularly in Cuyahoga County.

Four views of the labor force for arts & culture organizations were created and are discussed later in this document. The intent of the research was to look beyond the obvious occupations, such as musician, artist or actor, and find the types of occupations that organizations and their patrons depend on for daily operations, including trade, clerical, transportation, and maintenance workers. The outcomes generally were not listed as numerical findings, but were intended to display the variation of occupations used within the arts & culture sector.

SECTION I LOOKS AT FINDINGS FROM DATA PROVIDED BY THE LABOR MARKET INFORMATION (LMI) DIVISION AT OHIO DEPARTMENT OF JOBS AND FAMILY SERVICES (ODJFS). This data was derived from the U.S. industryoccupation matrix.

When data from Section I was reviewed, it was clear that some occupations, due to the data coming from a national source rather than an Ohio-based source, were not applicable to the Northeast Ohio region. To better understand the demand for occupations from arts & culture organizations in this region, a QUALITATIVE STUDY WAS UNDERTAKEN VIA A SERIES OF INTERVIEWS CONDUCTED AT ARTS & CULTURE ORGANI-ZATIONS IN CUYAHOGA COUNTY ABOUT HOW (AND BY WHOM) SERVICES WERE PROVIDED AND/OR PURCHASED. THESE FINDINGS ARE REPORTED IN SECTION II.

SECTION III RELIES ON DATA FROM A STUDY FOR THE PARTNERSHIP OF THE ECONOMIC IMPACT OF SELECTED ARTS & CULTURE ORGANIZATIONS ON CUYAHOGA **COUNTY.** The economic impact study was done concurrently with this occupational study and provides estimates of employment created by visitor-patron spending at selected arts venues. In the economic impact study, only patrons who resided outside of Cuyahoga County were included in the estimates. Therefore, the findings will indicate occupations from visitor spending at various locations such as hotels, restaurants, and retail locations.

SECTION IV LOOKS AT THE PREVALENCE OF ARTS & CULTURE OCCUPATIONS IN INDUS-TRIES ACROSS NORTHEAST OHIO. This data, from LMI at ODJFS, suggests that two out of three workers in the region are in firms that employ arts & culturerelated workers.

SECTION I: STATE OF OHIO ESTIMATES OF OCCUPATIONS WITHIN ARTS & CULTURE ORGANIZATIONS

The first step in assessing how arts & culture dollars impact employment across the region was to access the Labor Market Information (LMI) division Web site¹, provided by the Ohio Division of Jobs and Family Services (ODJFS). This Web site allows access to the industry-occupation matrix for the State of Ohio. This matrix provides information about what occupations are needed for individual 4-digit Standard Industrial Classification (SIC) codes.

The industries that make up the "Arts and Culture" cluster were identified by finding SIC codes assigned to a range of arts & culture venues from a list provided by The Partnership. Industries used with the industry-occupation matrix were:

- 7911–Dance Studios, Schools and Halls
- 7922—Theatrical Producers (Except Motion Picture), and Miscellaneous Theatrical Services
- 7929—Bands, Orchestras, Actors and Other Entertainers and Entertainment Groups
- 8412–Museums and Art Galleries
- 8422—Arboreta and Botanical or Zoological Gardens

The initial review of the LMI site using the matrix for Ohio was unproductive, as many of the industries under review did not contain sufficient data to indicate staffing patterns for Ohio industries. The LMI Web site contained not only the Ohio matrix, but also the U.S. industry-occupation matrix. A review of the industries contained in the U.S. matrix indicated that it could be used to identify occupations employed by arts & culture organizations. The one caveat for this matrix, of course, is that the industry hiring behavior and staffing patterns are based on national patterns, which may, due to the geographic and product scope, include a more varied set of occupations than would the same industry at Ohio or Northeast Ohio levels.

The U.S. staffing patterns for each industry were downloaded and combined, with multiple observations of occupations being removed. The combined industry-occupation matrix yielded almost 250 unique² occupations that may be employed by the arts & culture industry in Northeast Ohio. While individual occupations are too numerous to list here (see Appendix A for a complete listing), major occupational categories are:

- Management
- Business and financial operations
- Computer and mathematics
- Architecture and engineering
- · Life, physical, and social science
- Community and social services
- Legal
- Education, training, and library
- Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media

- Health care practitioners and technicians
- Health care support
- · Food preparation and serving
- Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance
- Personal care and service
- Sales
- · Office and administration support
- Farming, fishing, and forestry
- · Construction and extraction
- · Installation, maintenance, and repair
- Production
- Transportation and material moving

As you can see, a wide range of occupations are part of the staffing pattern, even at the major categories level. At first glance, some occupational categories may seem out of place, such as "Farming, fishing and forestry." Remember that while the main product of these industries is art & culture, and in some cases displaying horticulture (Cleveland Botanical Garden), operation of the businesses requires significant inputs from labor, including the movement of goods, maintenance of buildings and grounds, construction, reconstruction and renovation, providing services to guests/patrons (including first aid), and many other aspects of managing a business, such as financial and executive management.

- ¹ http://www.ohioworkforceinformer.com/
- Although they were counted as unique, some occupations were variants on a theme, such as cooks, short-order cooks, restaurant cooks, and institutional cooks.

Northeast Ohio is populated by a large number of nonprofit organizations, small businesses and self-employed professionals. Although many factors affect the competitive advantage of this and other industries, none is as important as the competencies of the workforce they embody. The arts & culture industry may best be defined as a cluster of occupations (and the skills that comprise them) needed to operate the industry at various locations and venues. Upon reviewing arts & culture occupations within these industry sectors, it was determined that several workers were not readily identifiable as part of "major industry sectors."

The arts & culture industry in

Beyond the thinkers and doers trained and employed in this industry, there are other professionals who are embedded in the base of the industry and play an important part of the arts & culture industry in Northeast Ohio.

To understand the extent of these hidden or embedded individuals, a series of interviews were conducted with representatives from performing, musical and visual arts organizations. The Partnership selected the firms to be interviewed. Interviews focused on the types, quantity and compensation of employees contracted or employed at the various venues. Interviews were not intended to complete a census of individuals, but rather to provide examples of how and where these individuals add to the economic assets of this industry — and presumably its growth.

OPERATIONS: Outside of Northeast Ohio's administrative, artistic, professional and scholarly services, and technical production and support, the arts industry employs a significant number of individuals who are independent contractors and highly entrepreneurial. These independent contractors particularly artists and performers for limited one-time events — are a regular component of the nonprofit arts & culture workforce.

We found that arts & culture organizations generally own and operate their own facilities and have many logistical, technical, and operational needs when it comes to running their buildings. Many smaller organizations employ a few full-time artists and managers to run their programs and facilities. Most employees at small organizations are cross-trained to act as CEO, artist, teacher, carpenter, and ticket taker. Thus, we did not see much reported employment of occupations such as electricians, carpenters, custodians, stagehands, teamsters, etc. This prompted several questions that were pursued during our interviews. As suspected, these organizations do indeed employ a variety of these labor functions and in varying capacities.

USE OF ORGANIZED LABOR: Union labor is employed directly and indirectly at many of the arts & culture venues. Large organizations and venues, such as Playhouse Square, employ union labor in the form of teamsters, stagehands, electricians, ticket takers, other maintenance workers, and wardrobe workers. This type of employment usually varies from show to show, based on changing needs and size of the show.

These large organizations also hire contract companies for caterers, cleaners, parking attendants, and off-duty police and firemen for security and code enforcement. Several of these functions are outsourced to private companies that operate under union agreements, including janitorial and cleaning services (Services Employees International Union) and food services (Hotel Employees and Restaurant Employees Union). These labor and service workers are not included in any of the organizations' employment counts because they are not direct employees of the organizations.

SECTION II: INTERVIEWS WITH ARTS & CULTURE ORGANIZATIONS

SECTION II: INTERVIEWS WITH ARTS & CULTURE ORGANIZATIONS (CONT.)

VOLUNTEERS: The arts & culture industry sectors are able to function and compete with commercial entertainment because of the large number of individuals who volunteer. The uniqueness of the volunteer and the number of volunteers indicates strong community support for arts & culture in this region. The Cleveland Opera uses between 300 and 500 volunteers providing a range of services including education and home hospitality for guest artists. Near West Theatre, first established as a summer youth theatre and now offering year-round theatre activities focusing on serving the youth, has its entire operation staffed by over 1,000 volunteers who produce five shows annually.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMING: There are a significant number of arts & culture organizations that provide education to children and adults. Many of these organizations reach out to communities, especially to the needy, as part of their normal operations. For example, Young Audiences contracts between 75 and 125 independent musicians, dancers, poets, dramatists, literary artists, and visual artists that reach 325,000 students in a six-county area. Larger organizations dedicate educational divisions (e.g., The Cleveland Orchestra and The Cleveland Museum of Art) and also engage independent artists and performers.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT: At the other end of the size spectrum, smaller community organizations, who see their mission as driving positive change in the community by promoting cultural tolerance (Art House, Inc.), spurring local renovation and investment (Cleveland Public Theatre), creating places in Cleveland's urban landscape (Cleveland Public Art), or creating opportunities for developing and experimenting artists (SPACES), operate with small staffs but often spend significant funds on projects that employ independent professionals in the arts & culture workforce.

The spectrum of occupations examined in this section indicates that many labor occupations, not just artists and management, are contributing to the production and output of arts & culture. Having a large pool of skilled labor/ professionals not only means venues do not have to look far to find the talent needed, but that individuals in the industry have a deep market of opportunities in which to seek employment. NORTHEAST OHIO'S VIBRANT AND FLEXIBLE LABOR MARKET CLEARLY CONTRIBUTES TO THE SUSTAINABILITY OF ARTS & CULTURE ENTERPRISES. MORE IMPORTANTLY, IT DISTINGUISHES THIS INDUSTRY AS ONE, LIKE OTHER BUSINESS SECTORS, THAT CREATES CONSIDERABLE ECONOMIC ACTIVITY AND JOBS.

Note: Appendix B summarizes the types of employment at the venues selected for interviews. Appendix C provides supporting information to the table in Appendix B.

SECTION III: STAFFING PATTERNS FROM THE ECONOMIC IMPACT ANALYSIS

The Partnership requested that Growth conduct an economic impact of arts & culture in Cuyahoga County in research done concurrently with this study. The estimates of impact were based on spending patterns by visitor-patrons who resided outside of Cuyahoga County. Using "out of county" residency as a condition for inclusion in the study is based on the assumption that only dollars imported into the county for services exported create an actual "economic" impact. Any spending by local residents on arts & culture is considered substitution. In the latter case, purchases represent a choice among alternatives within the county, and while we acknowledge that these choices have an impact, it is not an economic impact by definition.

Based on the export-base model for impacts, only visitor spending data was collected from patrons. Spending categories for this study included the value of:

- Hotel rooms
- Car rental
- Meals
- Arts & entertainment
- Retail purchases
- Local transportation
- Travel from Cleveland³

The estimates of spending were derived using a survey-based sample of patrons at nine arts & culture venues in Cuyahoga County and estimates based on extrapolations from attendance at another 15 venues in Cuyahoga County. Impact estimates were created using the survey data, which was put into a Cuyahoga-centric REMI economic impact model⁴ for analysis. Note that the analysis was based completely on visitor spending and that the value of ongoing operations of the venues was not included.

The analysis revealed that for the 24 arts & culture venues there were an additional 3,626 jobs created from visitor spending in Cuyahoga County. Similar to the results in the earlier section, jobs were not only in the arts & culture industry, but also in industries including⁵:

- Management
- Business and financial operations
- Computer and mathematics
- Architecture and engineering
- Life, physical, and social science
- Community and social services
- Legal
- Education, training, and library
- Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media

- Health care practitioners and technicians
- · Health care support
- · Food preparation and serving
- Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance
- Personal care and service
- Sales
- Office and administration support
- Farming, fishing, and forestry
- Construction and extraction
- Installation, maintenance, and repair
- Production
- Transportation and material moving

- ³ Only the expenses for travel from Cleveland to zip code of residence was used. This splits the costs and benefits of travel between origin and destination.
- ⁴ Regional Economic Models, Inc., Amherst, MA, www.remi.com.
- ⁵ For a complete listing of all job estimates, see Appendix D.

SECTION IV: STATE OF OHIO ESTIMATES OF EMPLOYMENT WITHIN ARTS & CULTURE ORGANIZATIONS

This section reviews how arts & culture occupations are present in industries within the region. These occupations were determined by using the Ohio Department of Jobs and Family Services "Inform" database. Industries identified as employing arts & culture occupations were:

- Radio & television broadcasting
- Motion pictures
- Performing arts
- Photographic studios
- · Portrait, museums
- Botanical & zoological gardens
- Printing & publishing
- Miscellaneous amusement
- Recreation
- Individual and family services
- Civic & social organizations
- Membership organizations not
 elsewhere classified

It is important that arts & culture occupations are found in a variety of industries in Northeast Ohio. Having this large, diverse base of occupations to draw from helps make the arts & culture industry in Northeast Ohio more viable and vibrant.

The results of this study show that there are more than 3.96 million employees in Ohio and more than 1.08 million employees⁶ in the Cleveland-Akron CMSA who work in industries that utilize arts & culture occupations. Of these totals, there are approximately With approximately 68.8 percent of all employees in the Cleveland CMSA and 67.5 percent of all employees in Ohio working in industries that utilize arts & culture workers as an input to complete production of final goods and services, arts & culture occupations can potentially have a very deep impact on products across all industry sectors. Table 1 shows the total employment.

| | | | TABLE 1 |
|-------------------|---------------------|--|--|
| Area | Total Employment | Total Employment in Industries Employing Arts- Related Occupations | Number of Employees Working in an Arts- Related Occupation |
| OHIO | 5,877,811 | 3,965,551 | 80,922 |
| CLEVELAND CMSA | 1,574,742 | 1,083,654 | 21,680 |

80,922 arts & culture workers in Ohio and 21,680 arts & culture workers in the Cleveland CMSA. While arts & culture workers in the Cleveland CMSA and Ohio make up only 1.38 percent of all workers, they are found in a wide variety of industries and more than half of all establishments.

⁵ This is the total employment for all industries that have workers in arts & culture organizations.

SECTION IV: STATE OF OHIO ESTIMATES OF EMPLOYMENT WITHIN ARTS & CULTURE ORGANIZATIONS (CONT.)

Most of the rapidly growing industries that employ arts & culture occupations are in the services sector. Some of these industries include:

- Museums, botanical & zoological gardens
- Engineering & management services
- Business services
- Social services
- Miscellaneous retail

Arts & culture employment in manufacturing sectors are seeing the slowest growth rates in:

- Chemicals & allied products
- Electronic & other electronic equipment
- Apparel & accessory stores
- Instruments & related products
- Industrial machinery & equipment

While the slow growth on the manufacturing side is not as encouraging as the increasing growth in the services arena, there are obviously many diverse sectors that employ arts & culture occupations and the many products that these occupations influence. Table 2 shows the fastest and slowest growing sectors employing arts & culture occupations.

TABLE 2

| Industry | Annual | Establishments | Employment in |
|---|-------------|----------------|---------------|
| | Growth Rate | in Cleveland | Cleveland |
| | | CMSA (2003) | CMSA (2003) |
| Museums, Botanical & Zoological Gardens | 5.00% | 127 | 1,388 |
| Engineering & Management Services | 4.13% | 6,659 | 75,643 |
| Business Services | 3.69% | 9,554 | 78,716 |
| Social Services | 3.62% | 2,821 | 41,352 |
| Miscellaneous Retail | 3.20% | 6,645 | 45,139 |
| Industrial Machinery & Equipment | 0.07% | 2,135 | 50,059 |
| Instruments & Related Products | 0.00% | 364 | 11,726 |
| Apparel & Accessory Stores | -0.28% | 1,760 | 12,656 |
| Electronic & Other Electronic Equipment | -0.32% | 482 | 22,185 |
| Chemicals & Allied Products | -1.05% | 497 | 29,076 |

The growth in service-providing industries has caused the bulk of workers in arts & culture occupations to be employed in positions crucial to the products and marketing of service providers. The occupations where most arts & culture workers are employed are in the positions of writers & editors, including technical; designers, except interior; artists & commercial artists; writers & editors; and photographers. *(See Table 3.)*

TABLE 3

| Occupation | Employment in Cleveland | | |
|--|-------------------------|-------------|--|
| | CMSA | Growth Rate | |
| Writers & Editors, Including Technical | 18,635 | 1.70% | |
| Designers, Except Interior | 3,884 | 2.21% | |
| Artists & Commercial Artists | 3,378 | 2.00% | |
| Writers & Editors | 2,194 | 1.97% | |
| Photographers | 1,629 | 0.00% | |

7

SECTION IV: STATE OF OHIO ESTIMATES OF EMPLOYMENT WITHIN ARTS & CULTURE ORGANIZATIONS (CONT.)

Twelve of the 20 occupations identified as arts & culture-related for this study are growing faster than the 1.25 annual percentage increase that is the average for all occupations in the State of Ohio. Only two occupations, reporters and radio & TV announcers are expected to experience a decline in numbers. Table 4 lists the fastest-growing occupations.

| | | | TABLE 4 |
|---|-------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Occupation | Annual | 2003 Employment | 2008 Employment |
| | Growth Rate | in Cleveland | in Cleveland |
| | | CMSA | CMSA |
| Technical Writers & Editors | 3.57% | 530 | 624 |
| Camera Operators, TV & Motion Pictures | 3.00% | 133 | 153 |
| Producers, Directors, Actors & Entertainers | 2.53% | 578 | 651 |
| Dancers & Choreographers | 2.22% | 216 | 240 |
| Designers (Except Interior) | 2.21% | 3884 | 4314 |

The industries demanding the highest proportion of arts & culture occupations in the Cleveland CMSA are diverse, but are mostly in the services sector. Industries employing the largest amount of arts & culture occupations are printing & publishing, business services, communications, membership organizations, and miscellaneous retail. *(See Table 5.)*

| Industry | Workers in | Percentage of 2003 Arts Workers in Cleveland CMSA | 2008 Projected Employment for Arts Workers in Cleveland CMSA | Annual Growth Rate |
|--------------------------|------------|---|---|-----------------------|
| Printing & Publishing | 3,652 | 16.85% | 3,772 | 0.60% |
| Business Services | 2,819 | 13.00% | 3,340 | 3.69% |
| Communications | 2,777 | 12.81% | 2,862 | 0.61% |
| Membership Organizations | 2,215 | 10.22% | 2,359 | 1.30% |
| Miscellaneous Retail | 1,730 | 7.98% | 2,007 | 3.20% |

TADLE 5

TABLE 6

The industries in Northeast Ohio that employ arts & culture occupations produce more than \$1.8 billion in sales, which account for 57.1 percent of the region's total sales and 14.6 percent of all sales in Ohio. This means that somewhere in the process of production or marketing of products, someone in an arts & culture occupation influenced the end product or sale of the product. These large percentages of total sales indicate that arts & culture occupations have a deep impact in many of the region's and Ohio's products. Table 6 details these percentages.

| Sales for Arts Employing | Cleveland CMSA | Ohio Total | Percent of | Percent of |
|--------------------------|----------------|---------------|----------------|------------|
| Industries in Cleveland | Total Sales | Sales | Cleveland CMSA | Ohio Total |
| CMSA (Millions) | (Millions) | (Millions) | Total Sales | Sales |
| \$188,339.2 | \$329,899.9 | \$1,292,568.5 | 57.1% | 14.6% |

This research has discussed some interesting and important findings. Prior to the start of the work, it was assumed that when most people thought of "arts & culture" occupations, they immediately thought of musicians, painters, singers, and other performance, visual and literary artists. This research has found that the arts & culture industry utilizes nearly 250 unique occupations, based not only on the product, but also on the process of running the venue.

Any business requires a wide range of staff members, including managerial, trade, clerical, transportation, and grounds/maintenance workers. In some cases (as described in Section II), these services may be staffed internally to the organization, and in other cases, may be staffed through unions and contracts with specialized firms. In Section III, we reviewed the staffing patterns from a separate piece of research conducted on behalf of The Partnership. This work estimated the impact of visitor-patrons to arts & culture venues in Cuyahoga County. While the finding of more than 3,600 jobs in Cuyahoga County was significant, the occupations generated by visitors was equally interesting. A wide range of occupations, similar to the findings in Section I, were needed to support visitors to the county.

In Section IV, we investigated how widespread arts & culture occupations are in various industries in Northeast Ohio. It was found that these occupations were deeply embedded in a number of non-arts & culture industries. It would appear that, given the breadth of arts & culture occupations in the region, they have a significant impact on the region and its firms.

SUMMARY & CONCLUSIONS

IN SUMMARY, IT IS CLEAR THAT THE ARTS & CULTURE COMMUNITY AND ITS VENUES ARE SOURCES OF A WIDE RANGE OF OCCU-PATIONS BEYOND THOSE TRADITIONALLY THOUGHT OF AS SUPPORTED BY THE ARTS. EQUALLY, IT IS CLEAR THAT ARTS & CULTURE OCCUPATIONS ARE EMBEDDED IN A WIDE RANGE OF INDUSTRIES WITHIN THE REGION AND PROVIDE AN IMPORTANT INPUT FOR THESE INDUSTRIES.

Code Occupation

| MANAGEMENT OCC | CUPATIONS |
|----------------|--|
| 1110110016 | Chief executives |
| 1110210035 | General and operations managers |
| 1113000002 | Management, business, and financial occupations |
| 1120000005 | Advertising, marketing, promotions, public relations |
| 1120200007 | Marketing and sales managers |
| 1120210008 | Marketing managers |
| 1130110004 | Administrative services managers |
| 1130210017 | Computer and information systems managers |
| 1130310031 | Financial managers |
| 1130400036 | Human resources managers |
| 1190100011 | Agricultural managers |
| 1190110012 | Farm, ranch, and other agricultural managers |
| 1190300022 | Education administrators |
| 1190410027 | Engineering managers |
| 1190510032 | Food service managers |
| 1190710034 | Gaming managers |
| 1190810042 | Lodging managers |
| 1191980053 | All other managers |

BUSINESS AND FINANCIAL OPERATIONS OCCUPATIONS

| 1300000055 | Business and financial operations occupations |
|------------|---|
| 1310000056 | Business operations specialists |
| 1310110057 | Agents and business managers of artists, performers, and athletes |
| 1310200058 | Buyers and purchasing agents |
| 1310410065 | Compliance officers, except agriculture, construction, health |
| 1310710070 | Employment, recruitment, and placement specialists |
| 1310720069 | Compensation, benefits, and job analysis specialists |
| 1310900068 | Human resources, training, and labor relations specialists |
| 1311110072 | Management analysts |
| 1311210073 | Meeting and convention planners |
| 1311980074 | All other business operations specialists |
| 1320000078 | Financial specialists |
| 1320110079 | Accountants and auditors |
| 1320510083 | Financial analysts |
| 1320990092 | All other financial specialists |

_ __ _

| Code | <u>Occupation</u> |
|----------------|---|
| COMPUTER AND M | ATHEMATICAL OCCUPATIONS |
| 1510000095 | Computer specialists |
| 1510210096 | Computer programmers |
| 1510300106 | Computer software engineers |
| 1510310107 | Computer software engineers, applications |
| 1510410109 | Computer support specialists |
| 1510510102 | Computer systems analysts |
| 1510610110 | Database administrators |
| 1510990113 | All other computer specialists |
| 1511000100 | Computer scientists and systems analysts |

ARCHITECTURE AND ENGINEERING OCCUPATIONS

| 1720000132 | Engineers |
|------------|--|
| 1720510137 | Civil engineers |
| 1720700139 | Electrical and electronics engineers |
| 1720710140 | Electrical engineers |
| 1720810142 | Environmental engineers |
| 1721410148 | Mechanical engineers |
| 1721990152 | All other engineers |
| 1730000156 | Drafters, engineering, and mapping technicians |
| 1730230164 | Electrical and electronic engineering technicians |
| 1730500161 | Engineering technicians, except drafters |
| 1730990170 | All other drafters, engineering, and mapping technicians |
| | |

LIFE, PHYSICAL, AND SOCIAL SCIENCE OCCUPATIONS

| 1910000176 | Life scientists |
|------------|--|
| 1910100177 | Agricultural and food scientists |
| 1910300186 | Conservation scientists and foresters |
| 1910600192 | All other life scientists |
| 1930200215 | Market and survey researchers |
| 1930210216 | Market research analysts |
| 1940000237 | Life, physical, and social science technicians |

COMMUNITY AND SOCIAL SERVICES OCCUPATIONS

| 2110120254 | Educational, vocational, and school counselors |
|------------|---|
| 2110300253 | Counselors |
| 2120210268 | Directors, religious activities and education |
| 2190990273 | All other counselors, social, and religious workers |

LEGAL OCCUPATIONS

2310110283

Lawyers

| Code | Occupation | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|
| Education, train | ING, AND LIBRARY OCCUPATIONS | | | |
| 2520120335 | Kindergarten teachers, except special education | | | |
| 2520200336 | Elementary and middle school teachers | | | |
| 2520210337 | Elementary school teachers, except special education | | | |
| 2530110348 | Adult literacy, remedial education, and GED teachers and instructors | | | |
| 2539990350 | All other teachers, primary, secondary, and adult | | | |
| 2540100353 | Archivists, curators, and museum technicians | | | |
| 2540100353 | Archivists, curators, and museum technicians | | | |
| 2540210357 | Librarians | | | |
| 2540310358 | Library technicians | | | |
| 2541000352 | Library, museum, training, and other education occupations | | | |
| 2590310363 | Instructional coordinators | | | |
| 2591990364 | All other library, museum, training, and other education workers | | | |
| Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media occupations | | | | |
| 2710000367 | Art and design occupations | | | |
| 2710110369 | Art directors | | | |
| 2710130370 | Fine artists, including painters, sculptors, and illustrator | | | |
| 2710220374 | Fashion designers | | | |
| 2710230375 | Floral designers | | | |
| 2710240376 | Graphic designers | | | |
| 2710250377 | Interior designers | | | |
| 2710260378 | Merchandise displayers and window trimmers | | | |
| 2710990380 | All other art and design workers | | | |
| 2711100368 | Artists and related workers | | | |
| 2711200372 | Designers | | | |
| 2720000384 | Entertainers and performers, sports and related occupations | | | |
| 2720100385 | Actors, producers, and directors | | | |
| 2720110386 | Actors | | | |
| 2720200388 | Athletes, coaches, umpires, and related workers | | | |
| 2720210389 | Athletes and sports competitors | | | |
| 2720220390 | Coaches and scouts | | | |
| 2720300392 | Dancers and choreographers | | | |
| 2720310393 | Dancers | | | |
| 2720320394 | Choreographers | | | |
| 2730000399 | Media and communication occupations | | | |
| 2730100400 | Announcers | | | |
| 2730910412 | Interpreters and translators | | | |
| 2730990413 | All other media and communication workers | | | |
| 2740000414 | Media and communication equipment occupations | | | |
| 2740100415 | Broadcast and sound engineering technicians and radio operators | | | |
| 2740110416 | Audio and video equipment technicians | | | |
| 2740120417 | Broadcast technicians | | | |
| 2740310422 | Camera operators, television, video, and motion picture | | | |
| 2740320423 | Film and video editors | | | |
| 2740990424 | All other media and communication equipment workers | | | |

_ _ _

| Code | Occupation | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|--|--|
| HEALTH CARE PRACTITIONERS AND TECHNICAL OCCUPATIONS | | | | | |
| 2910000426 | Health diagnosing and treating practitioners | | | | |
| 2910310434 | Dietitians and nutritionists | | | | |
| 2911980473 | All other health diagnosing and treating practitioners | | | | |
| 2920500487 | Health diagnosing and treating practitioner support techniciar | | | | |
| 2920510488 | Dietetic technicians | | | | |
| 2991980503 | All other health practitioners and technical workers | | | | |
| Health care supi | PORT OCCUPATIONS | | | | |
| 3190800520 | Medical assistants and other healthcare support occupations | | | | |
| 3190990526 | All other healthcare support workers | | | | |
| 3310990532 | First-line supervisors/managers of protective service worker | | | | |
| 3390950553 | All other protective service workers | | | | |
| Food preparation | AND SERVING-RELATED OCCUPATIONS | | | | |
| 3510110558 | Chefs and head cooks | | | | |
| 3510120559 | First-line supervisors/managers of food preparation and servers | | | | |
| 3520110562 | Cooks, fast food | | | | |
| 3520120563 | Cooks, institution and cafeteria | | | | |
| 3520140565 | Cooks, restaurant | | | | |
| 3520150566 | Cooks, short order | | | | |
| 3520210567 | Food preparation workers | | | | |
| 3521000560 | Cooks and food preparation workers | | | | |
| 3530000568 | Food and beverage serving workers | | | | |
| 3530110569 | Bartenders | | | | |
| 3530210570 | Combined food preparation and serving workers | | | | |
| 3530220571 | Counter attendants, cafeteria, food concession, and coffee shop | | | | |
| 3530410572 | Food servers, non-restaurant | | | | |
| 3590110575 | Dining room and cafeteria attendants and bartender helpers | | | | |
| 3590210576 | Dishwashers | | | | |
| 3590310577 | Hosts and hostesses, restaurant, lounge, and coffee shop | | | | |
| 3590980578 | All other food preparation and serving related workers | | | | |
| Building and gro | DUNDS CLEANING AND MAINTENANCE OCCUPATIONS | | | | |
| 3710110583 | First-line supervisors/managers of housekeeping and janitorial | | | | |
| 3710120584 | First-line supervisors/managers of landscaping, lawn service | | | | |
| 3720110586 | Janitors and cleaners, except maids and housekeeping cleaner | | | | |
| 3720120587 | Maids and housekeeping cleaners | | | | |
| 3721000585 | Building cleaning workers | | | | |

- 3730110592 Landscaping and groundskeeping workers
- 3731000591 Grounds maintenance workers
- 3790990596 All other building and grounds cleaning and maintenance work

| Code | Occupation |
|------------------|---|
| Personal care an | ND SERVICE OCCUPATIONS |
| 3910210600 | First-line supervisors/managers of personal service workers |
| 3920000601 | Animal care and service workers |
| 3920110602 | Animal trainers |
| 3930210608 | Motion picture projectionists |
| 3930800610 | Miscellaneous entertainment attendants and related workers |
| 3930880612 | Costume, locker room and other attendants |
| 3930910611 | Amusement and recreation attendants |
| 3931000607 | Entertainment attendants and related workers |
| 3950120630 | Hairdressers, hairstylists, and cosmetologists |
| 3950900631 | Miscellaneous personal appearance workers |
| 3990310637 | Fitness trainers and aerobics instructors |
| 3990980650 | All other personal care and service workers |
| SALES AND RELATE | D OCCUPATIONS |
| 4110110675 | First-line supervisors/managers of retail sales workers |
| 4110120676 | First-line supervisors/managers of non-retail sales workers |
| 4120100655 | Cashiers |
| 4120210658 | Counter and rental clerks |
| 4130110654 | Advertising sales agents |
| 4190980679 | All other sales and related workers |
| OFFICE AND ADMIN | ISTRATION SUPPORT OCCUPATIONS |
| 4310110683 | First-line supervisors/managers of office and administrative |
| 4320000684 | Communications equipment operators |
| 4320990687 | All other communications equipment operators |
| 4330000689 | Financial clerks |
| 4330110690 | Bill and account collectors |
| 4330210691 | Billing and posting clerks and machine operators |
| 4330310692 | Bookkeeping, accounting, and auditing clerks |
| 4340000697 | Information and record clerks |
| 4340510702 | Customer service representatives |
| 4340710704 | File clerks |
| 4340810705 | Hotel, motel, and resort desk clerks |
| 4341610706 | Human resources assistants, except payroll and timekeeping |
| 4349990714 | All other financial, information, and record clerks |
| 4350000716 | Material recording, scheduling, dispatching, and distributing |
| 4350210718 | Couriers and messengers |
| 4350300719 | Dispatchers |
| 4350320720 | Dispatchers, except police, fire, and ambulance |
| 4351990731 | All other material recording, scheduling, dispatching, and distributing |
| 4360110744 | Executive secretaries and administrative assistants |
| 4370000688 | Financial, information, and record clerks |
| 4390110733 | Computer operators |
| 4390200734 | Data entry and information processing workers |
| 4390210735 | Data entry keyers |
| 4390510739 | Mail clerks and mail machine operators, except postal service |
| 4399990749 | All other secretaries, administrative assistants, and other |

_ _ _

| Code | Occupation |
|------------------|--|
| Farming, fishing | , AND FORESTRY OCCUPATIONS |
| 4510100752 | First-line supervisors/managers/contractors of farming, fishing and forestry |
| 4520800757 | Farm workers |
| 4521000755 | Agricultural workers |
| 4591000771 | All other farming, fishing, and forestry workers |
| CONSTRUCTION A | ND EXTRACTION OCCUPATIONS |
| 4710110779 | First-line supervisors/managers of construction trades and extraction |
| 4720000780 | Construction trades and related workers |
| 4720200782 | Brickmasons, blockmasons, and stonemasons |
| 4720310785 | Carpenters |
| 4720610794 | Construction laborers |
| 4720700795 | Construction equipment operators |
| 4721110802 | Electricians |
| 4730000817 | Helpers, construction trades |
| 4740950833 | All other construction and related workers |
| Installation, ma | INTENANCE, AND REPAIR OCCUPATIONS |
| 4910110856 | First-line supervisors/managers of mechanics, installers, and repairers |
| 4920000857 | Electrical and electronic equipment mechanics, installers, and repairers |
| 4920110859 | Computer, automated teller, and office machine repairers |
| 4920800862 | Electrical and electronics repairers, industrial and utility |
| 4920920860 | Electric motor, power tool, and related repairers |
| 4920940863 | Electrical and electronics repairers, commercial and industrial |
| 4920990871 | All other electrical and electronic equipment mechanics |
| 4930210876 | Automotive body and related repairers |
| 4930230878 | Automotive service technicians and mechanics |
| 4930310879 | Bus and truck mechanics and diesel engine specialists |
| 4930400880 | Heavy vehicle and mobile equipment service technicians |
| 4930420882 | Mobile heavy equipment mechanics, except engines |
| 4930800888 | Miscellaneous vehicle and mobile equipment mechanics |
| 4930910889 | Bicycle repairers |
| 4930990892 | All other vehicle and mobile equipment mechanics, installers |
| 4990210898 | Heating, air conditioning, and refrigeration mechanics |
| 4990420906 | Maintenance and repair workers, general |
| 4990430907 | Maintenance workers, machinery |
| 4990880917 | All other installation, maintenance, and repair workers |
| 4990910894 | Coin, vending, and amusement machine servicers and repairers |
| 4990980899 | Helpers-installation, maintenance, and repair workers |

| Code | Occupation | | | |
|------------------------|---|--|--|--|
| PRODUCTION OCCUPATIONS | | | | |
| 5110110924 | First-line supervisors/managers of production and operating | | | |
| 5120000925 | Assemblers and fabricators | | | |
| 5120310931 | Engine and other machine assemblers | | | |
| 5120900933 | Miscellaneous assemblers and fabricators | | | |
| 5120910934 | Fiberglass laminators and fabricators | | | |
| 5120990937 | All other assemblers and fabricators | | | |
| 5130000938 | Food processing occupations | | | |
| 5130110939 | Bakers | | | |
| 5140000948 | Metal workers and plastic workers | | | |
| 5140310952 | Cutting, punching, and press machine setters, operators, | | | |
| 5140410960 | Machinists | | | |
| 5160111003 | Laundry and dry-cleaning workers | | | |
| 5160991018 | All other textile, apparel, and furnishings workers | | | |
| 5191931034 | Cooling and freezing equipment operators and tenders | | | |
| 5191981045 | Helpers-production workers | | | |
| 5191991064 | All other production workers | | | |
| TRANSPORTATION / | AND MATERIAL MOVING OCCUPATIONS | | | |
| 5310211068 | First-line supervisors/managers of helpers, laborers | | | |
| 5310311069 | First-line supervisors/managers of transportation | | | |
| 5330201080 | Bus drivers | | | |
| 5330211082 | Bus drivers, transit and intercity | | | |
| 5330301083 | Driver/sales workers and truck drivers | | | |
| 5330311084 | Driver/sales workers | | | |
| 5330991088 | All other motor vehicle operators | | | |
| 5370001113 | Material moving occupations | | | |
| 5370321117 | Excavating and loading machine and dragline operators | | | |
| 5370511119 | Industrial truck and tractor operators | | | |
| 5370611114 | Cleaners of vehicles and equipment | | | |
| 5370621120 | Laborers and freight, stock, and material movers | | | |
| 5370981129 | All other material moving workers | | | |
| | | | | |

_ _ _

APPENDIX B — VENUES SELECTED FOR INTERVIEW PROCESS

| | Full-Time Employees | Part-Time Employees | VOLUNTEERS | Use Contractors | Use Labor Unions | Annual Budget |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|------------|--------------------|-----------------------|------------------|
| Cleveland Orchestra | 35 | | Hundreds | | I,M,S | |
| Cleveland Opera | 25 | | 300-500 | 300 | T,I,M,S | \$4mm |
| Playhouse Square Foundation | 106 | 213 | | 54 | T,I,M,S | \$34.6mm |
| Beck Center | 23 | 159 | 100+ | Yes | No | \$2.2mm |
| Karamu House | 20 | 5 | 75 | Yes | No | \$1.5mm |
| Young Audiences | 7 | | | 75–125 | No | \$1.6mm |
| Near West Theater | 6 | 1 | 1200 | | No | |
| Cleveland Playhouse | 80 | 70 | 150 | 470K | Yes | \$8.5mm |
| Cleveland Public Theater | 11 | 5 | Yes | 283 | No | |
| Cleveland Museum of Art | 269 | 145 | 900 | \$2.4mm | Service Emps Int'l | |
| Cleveland Museum of Natural History | 100 | 50 | 80 | No | No | \$10mm |
| Museum of Contemporary Art | 15 | 5 | 6–8 | 25 | No | \$1.4mm |
| SPACES Gallery | 2 | 4 | | 60–70 | No | \$400,000 |
| Rock and Roll Hall of Fame | 86 | 14 | 44 | Yes | S | \$20mm |
| Cleveland Public Art | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5–15 | No | \$500-800,000 |
| Art House | 1 | 1 | 50–70 | 6-10 | No | \$200,000 |

T = Teamsters

I = Ticket Takers

M = Musicians

S = Stagehands

_ __ _

APPENDIX C — SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR APPENDIX B

- One exception to the rule of using labor unions was the Beck Center for the Arts in Lakewood. Beck Center employs all people who work under the roof of their building. The only contracts they listed were for snow removal, lawn care, and maintenance on their computer systems. Volunteers also provide a vital backbone of support to Beck Center's many productions.
- The Rock and Roll Hall of Fame and Museum relies heavily on IATSE labor and contracts for the many shows, concerts and special displays they bring in each year. Also relying on contracts for building services, the Rock Hall is able to limit its total employment to 100.
- The Cleveland Museum of Natural History employs relatively few union employees, usually just for construction projects, as needed. They rely heavily on contracts to fulfill needs such as exterior maintenance, HVAC, Web site design, equipment maintenance, and plumbing. They do, however, employ full-time janitorial and maintenance staff.

- The Cleveland Opera manages Severance Hall along with the Opera, so being able to limit their full-time employment to 25 people is dependent on five full-time union stagehands, seven members of the ticket takers union, four maintenance staff from the service employees union, and three union security staff members.
- Playhouse Square was the hardest to quantify, but they did identify the many unions that they draw employment from. Besides IATSE, ticket takers and Teamsters, Playhouse Square hires employees from actors, musicians, electricians, service employees, and wardrobe unions. They also directly hire policemen and firemen to provide security and building code enforcement. Playhouse Square contracts for catering, cleanup and parking services.
- Karamu House, one of the smaller venues, employs 20 full-time and five part-time staff, while maintaining a non-union shop. They contract with Labor Ready to provide temporary employment on a show-by-show basis.

- The Near West Theatre employs six full-time and one part-time employee. They rely on 1,200 volunteers annually to produce shows, run classes, and manage their building.
- Cleveland Public Theater employs 11 full-time and five part-time staff. They rely heavily on students and volunteers to provide most of the services they require.
- SPACES Gallery has two full-time and four part-time employees. They use no union labor, but they contract with many private businesses to provide services such as carpentry, electrical, advertising, marketing, cleaning and maintenance.
- Art House has one full-time and one part-time employee. They use no union labor and rely on six to 10 contractors to provide other services as needed, also heavily relying on 50 to 75 volunteers for most of their needs.

| <u>Occupation</u> | 2003 |
|--|----------|
| Food and beverage serving workers | 579 |
| Motor vehicle operators | 328 |
| Cooks and food preparation workers | 223 |
| Building cleaning workers | 194 |
| All other sales and related workers | 191 |
| Management occupations | 191 |
| Other food preparation and serving | 152 |
| Information and record clerks | 138 |
| Secretaries, administrative assistant | 128 |
| Construction trades and related workers | 98 |
| Retail salespersons | 89 |
| Other health professionals and technicians | 84 |
| Supervisors, food preparation | 73 |
| Material recording, scheduling, | 73 |
| Financial clerks | 69 |
| | 69 69 |
| Material moving occupations | |
| Other installation, maintenance | 58 |
| First-line supervisors/managers | 55 |
| Other protective service workers | 53 |
| Computer specialists | 51 |
| Vehicle and mobile equipment mechanics | 43 |
| Entertainment attendants and related | 41 |
| Grounds maintenance workers | 39 |
| Gaming occupations | 38 |
| Entertainers and performers, sports | 37 |
| Business operations specialists | 34 |
| Supervisors, sales workers | 34 |
| Recreation and fitness workers | 32 |
| Financial specialists | 30 |
| Other production occupations | 29 |
| Transportations, tourism, and lodging | 20 |
| Textile, apparel, and furnishings | 19 |
| Metal workers and plastic workers | 18 |
| Primary, secondary, and special education | 16 |
| Supervisors, building and grounds | 16 |
| Assemblers and fabricators | 16 |
| Healthcare support occupations | 15 |
| Child care workers | 14 |
| Engineers | 14 |
| Health diagnosing and treating practices | 13 |
| Food processing occupations | 13 |
| Drafters, engineering, and mapping | 10 |
| Personal appearance workers | 10 |
| Media and communications occupations | 10 |
| Related transportation occupations | 10 |
| | |

_ __

APPENDIX D — STAFFING IMPACTS FROM REMI ANALYSIS

| <u>Occupation</u> | 2003 |
|---|------|
| Supervisors, transportation and material movers | 9 |
| Art and design occupations | 9 |
| Communications equipment operators | 9 |
| Other teachers and instructors | 9 |
| Agricultural workers | 9 |
| Electrical and electronic equipment | 9 |
| Lawyers | 8 |
| Library, museum, training and other | 8 |
| All other personal care and service | 8 |
| Printing occupations | 6 |
| Media and communication equipment | 6 |
| Pest control workers and all other | 6 |
| All other and misc. legal and related | 5 |
| Post-secondary teachers | 5 |
| Law enforcement workers | 5 |
| All other and misc. counselors | 4 |
| All other financial, information, etc. | 3 |
| Animal care and service workers | 3 |
| Life, physical and social science | 3 |
| Real estate brokers and sales agent | 3 |
| Personal and home care aides | 3 |
| Social scientists and related occupations | 3 |
| Architects, surveyors, and cartographers | 3 |
| Religious workers | 3 |
| Counselors | 2 |
| Plant and system operators | 2 |
| Social workers | 2 |
| Physical scientists | 2 |
| Woodworkers | 2 |
| Fire fighters and inspectors | 2 |
| All other farming, fishing, etc. | 1 |
| Life scientists | 1 |
| Water transportation occupations | 1 |
| Other education, training, library | 1 |
| Air transportation occupation | 1 |
| Mathematical science occupations | 1 |
| Extraction workers | 1 |
| Funeral service workers | 1 |
| Residential advisors | 1 |
| | |

Total jobs impact

APPENDIX E — METHODOLOGY FOR SECTION IV

The first step in identifying employment numbers was to find the industries that include arts & culture-related occupations. This was done using the "Inform" database from the Ohio Department of Jobs and Family Services, Bureau of Labor Market Information (LMI). Occupation descriptions and industry information embedded in the "Inform" database were the basis for this analysis.

LMI was able to give us the number of arts & culture occupations employed in each industry in the State of Ohio by two-digit SIC code. From these figures, we could arrive at the percent of total employment in each industry for Ohio. In order to arrive at numbers for the Cleveland CMSA, we used industry employment figures provided by Dun & Bradstreet's (D&B) Marketplace database to create a matrix of employment by industry. The matrix works by first finding the quotient of the total number of Ohio arts & culture-related workers in each industry divided by the total number of employees. We then took this percentage and multiplied it by the total labor force for the Cleveland CMSA. The product is an estimate of the number of workers employed in an arts & culture-related occupation in the Cleveland CMSA.

Having the estimate of the number employed in arts & culture-related occupations allowed us to estimate future employment by industry. Future employment was calculated by annualizing the 10-year growth rate for each industry (obtained from LMI) and applying this rate to the number of workers employed in each industry. This allowed us to project employment from 2003 to 2008.

The number of establishments in each industry also was obtained from D&B, and the same growth rate for employment was applied to these figures to get an estimate for 2008.

Employment by occupation in the State of Ohio was obtained from LMI. The percent of state employment for each occupation was applied to D&B's employment figures to get an estimate of the number of workers in each occupation for the Cleveland CMSA. LMI also provided a 10-year projected employment figure, which was again annualized and applied to the 2003 employment levels, enabling an estimate for 2008 employment by occupation for the Cleveland CMSA.

Sales figures were taken from D&B for each industry employing arts & culture occupations. This figure was then divided by the total sales for the Cleveland CMSA and Ohio to get the percentage of each. It is important to note some possible errors in our methodology. The LMI data used 1998 employment figures, which is the most current year available for occupational employment data. The D&B data used 2003 figures. This could cause a problem in calculating the percentage of arts & culture-related occupational employment in an industry since there has been six years of growth in one part of the equation. We expect this to minimally impact the study.

Another area where small errors may develop is in using statewide data to calculate percentages for the Cleveland-Akron CMSA. Unfortunately, there are no data available at the CMSA level that show the number of workers by occupation in each industry. We are confident that the methodology used in this study is the best estimate, since the Cleveland-Akron CMSA represents well over a third of Gross State Product and a quarter of total employment. With such a large portion of economic activity, the Cleveland-Akron CMSA's industry makeup should closely mirror the statewide distribution, minimizing any error.